

CITY OF SAN JUAN BAUTISTA

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

STAFF REPORT

DATE: April 4th, 2017

SUBJECT: Site and Design Review – 322 Third Street

Applicant: Anthony and Monica Ramirez

Zoning: Mixed Use

Assessor Parcel No.: 002-160-003

Size: 7,173.342 ft²

Existing Land Use: Mixed Use

Environmental Review: Under Section 15331 of the California Environmental Quality Act, "Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation", the project is Categorically Exempt. The rationale for using this exemption is described in the "Process" section below.

Details: The property is located in the Mixed Use zone in the Historic District at the northeast corner of the intersection of Polk Street and Third Street. It is bordered by commercial uses to the east (Ponzini Insulation, Inc.) and public facilities to the north (San Juan Bautista City Hall and the fire department). The applicant is requesting site and design review approval for a beer and wine tasting room which will utilize the adjacent outdoor patio. The proposed use of the structure is an approved use in the Mixed Use zone, but the use of the outdoor patio will be contingent upon attaining a conditional use permit. That permit application has been filed separately.

Site and Design Review: The proposed project will make two main alterations to the exterior of the structure on the property: changing the paint color and installing new awning material. Samples of the paint color and awning material are included as attachments. The paint color scheme was chosen after consulting with local historic authorities. It includes:

- Exterior Base Color: Lamp Post (Dark Grey)
- Exterior Column Color: Fitzgerald Smoke (Light Grey)

- Door and Window Trim Color: Bicyclette (Red)

The awning design was designed based on the existing awning, but with the colors listed in the color palette above.

Historic Resources Preservation Process: Chapter 11-06 of the San Juan Bautista Municipal Code (SJBMC) lays out the process for handling applications for alterations to properties that are included in the City of San Juan Bautista Register of Historic Properties, including both contributing buildings with status codes 1 through 5 and noncontributing buildings.

Under SJBMC Section 11-06-120, "Site plan and design review permit procedure for historic resources", Planning staff must review permit applications and determine the following:

- 1) If the structure is more than forty-five (45) years old;**
 - a. This structure was built in the 1930's (est.), so it is more than 45 years old.
- 2) If the property has been previously inventoried as part of a Citywide comprehensive survey and what the current status code for the property is (see SJBMC 11-06-090 for the various possible status codes);**
 - a. This property was previously inventoried as part of a Citywide comprehensive survey, and has a status code of 5D1.
- 3) If the property is listed on the City Register of Historic Resources;**
 - a. This property is listed on the City Register of Historic Resources.
- 4) If the property is located within the boundaries of a designated historic district regardless of individual significance;**
 - a. This property is located within the boundaries of a designated historic district.
- 5) If the property will require additional evaluation as part of the application process; and**
 - a. This property will require additional evaluation as part of the application process due to the fact that the project proposes to change the paint color and the awning material, work which the SJBMC considers a "major alteration" because it "*alters the exterior appearance of an existing building or structure.*"
- 6) If the proposed alteration is a minor or major alteration.**
 - a. Based on the alterations proposed by the applicant, the proposed alterations fall under the SJBMC definition of "major alterations".

Based on those determinations, the proper review procedure can be found in Section 11-06-120(C)(5):

(5) Applications for major alterations or demolition to properties that are included in the City of San Juan Bautista Register of Historic Resources, including those properties that contribute to a designated historic district with status codes of 1 through 5 or to noncontributing buildings within designated historic districts, shall require the following:

(a) A historic resource evaluation and impact report shall be prepared by a qualified architectural historian that includes a discussion of the property's historic significance, the determination of project impacts and the application of how the project does or does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the City of San Juan Bautista Design Guidelines. The report will also include a discussion on how the proposed changes may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource in accordance with CEQA Guidelines and a discussion as to how the proposed project may impact the significance of a surrounding historic district, as applicable. The report may also include proposed measures to minimize or mitigate significant impacts, if such impacts exist.

a. An historic resource evaluation and impact report for this project was prepared by Alison Garcia Kellar, Architectural Historian at Garavaglia Architecture, Inc.

(b) The historic resource evaluation and impacts report will be attached to the site plan and design review application for review by the Historic Resources Board. The HRB will review the recommended impacts and treatments and make recommendations to the Planning Commission and applicant on ways to conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the City of San Juan Bautista's Design Guidelines. The Planning Commission will have discretionary authority over the approval of the application. Appeals on the determination made to the Planning Commission shall be directed to the City Council for approval.

a. The historic resource evaluation and impacts report is attached to the Site and Design Review application for the 18th Barrel Tasting Room project at 322 Third Street. It is attached to this staff report

as well. The report confirms that the proposed project conforms to all ten of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

(c) Proposed major alterations that comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties shall be considered a Class 31 categorical exemption under CEQA and no further review is required.

- a. The historic resource evaluation and impacts report determined that the project complies with all ten of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, so the project will be considered a Class 31 categorical exemption under CEQA and no further review is required.

Major Alterations to Interior

In Chapter 11-06-020 of the San Juan Bautista Municipal Code, the definition for "Major Alterations" covers alterations to both "*the exterior appearance of an existing building or structure,*" as well as "*the interior of a resource that is accessible to or has historically been made available to the public, including but not limited to areas commonly used as public spaces such as lobbies, meeting rooms, gathering rooms, public hallways, great halls, bank lobbies, shopping malls, stores, or other similar spaces.*" Some have made the argument that this gives the Historic Resources Board control over what alterations can be made to the interior of any historic building that has ever been open to the public. However, when covering the recommended treatment of interior spaces, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties refers only to interior spaces "***that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building***" (p.91).

The historic resource evaluation and impacts report that was created for this project examined all of the "character-defining features" for the structure and none of those features were on the interior of the structure. In addition, the report reveals that the structure has had several different uses over the years, during which time many non-character-defining aspects of the interior have undoubtedly changed without detracting from the "overall historic character of the building." Therefore, staff recommends that the Historic Resources Board refrain from placing any burdensome restrictions on what the property owner may or may not do with the interior of the structure.

Action Required:

1. Verify posting of notice of public hearing

2. Open the Public Hearing
3. Receive staff report and supporting documents
4. Receive written comments, e-mail communication, oral testimony and public input.
5. Close the public hearing
6. Review the project materials and the historic resource evaluation and impacts report to ensure that the project complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the City of San Juan Bautista's Design Guidelines and make any necessary recommendations to the Planning Commission
7. Based upon your independent review and judgment of the staff report, historic resource evaluation and impacts report, written comments, email communication, and oral testimony on the project, the Historic Resources Board should take the following actions.
 - A. Recommend that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution 2017-XX, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the City of San Juan Bautista making a determination for a categorical exemption for Site and Design Review (SDR 2017-32) for a wine and beer tasting establishment at 322 Third Street" under Section 15331 of the California Environmental Quality Act.
 - B. Recommend that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution 2017-XX, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the City of San Juan Bautista approving Site and Design Review Permit for a wine and beer tasting establishment at 322 Third Street (SDR 2017-32) Anthony and Monica Ramirez (Assessor Parcel No. 002-160-003)."

Attachments:

1. Secretary of the Interior's Standards Review for 322 Third Street – Alison Garcia Kellar – Architectural Historian - Garavaglia Architecture
2. Color Palette for 322 3rd Street – Ramirez
3. Conceptual Awning and Sign for 322 3rd Street – Ramirez
4. Site Plan and Elevations for 322 Third Street – Ramirez
5. Resolution PC 2017-XX Categorical Exemption for SDR 2017-32 – 322 Third Street
6. Resolution PC 2017-XX Approving SDR 2017-32 – 322 Third Street
7. SDR Application for 322 Third Street – Ramirez