



582 MARKET ST. SUITE 1800  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104

T: 415.391.9633

F: 415.391.9647

www.garavaglia.com

## MEMORANDUM

**Date:** March 24, 2017

**To:** Matt Orbach, Community Development Director  
City of San Juan Bautista

**From:** Alison Garcia Kellar, Architectural Historian

**Project:** 18<sup>th</sup> Barrel Tasting Room, 322 Third Street  
Project SDR 217-33

**Re:** Secretary of the Interior's Standards Review

**Via:** Email

### **Project Overview**

As part of the submittal package for the proposed work at 18<sup>th</sup> Barrel Tasting Room at 322 Third Street, Project SDR 217-33, a review for compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties is required. 322 Third Street (APN 002-016-003) is located to the east of the Third Street and Polk Street intersection in the City of San Juan Bautista.

### **Historical Status and Significance of 322 Third Street**

322 Third Street was listed as a contributor to the San Juan Bautista Third Street Historic District on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) in 2009. Because it is listed on the NRHP, 322 Third Street is also automatically listed on the California Register of Historical Resources (CRHR). In addition, the property was surveyed in 2006 by Galvin Preservation Associates along with approximately 700 other parcels in San Juan Bautista. As part of this survey, a DPR 523 form was prepared for 322 Third Street, and the building was assigned the status code 5D1, indicating that it is a contributor to a district that is listed or designated locally.<sup>1</sup> The survey updated and expanded the city's historic resources inventory, which had last been updated in 1981.

The 2009 NRHP district nomination specifies a period of significance of 1849–1948 for the entire district, which includes 26 contributing buildings and 8 non-contributing buildings. The district nomination describes 322 Third Street as a having no architectural style, but was previously a Western False Front style building which had

<sup>1</sup> Galvin Preservation Associates, *City of San Juan Bautista 2005–2006 Certified Local Government Grant Historical Resources Inventory and Context Statement* (September 2006), vi.

been modified in the 1930s.<sup>2</sup> The NRHP district nomination does not determine the specific significance of each building in the district individually, but rather provides a significance evaluation for the district as a whole. The NRHP nomination form states that the entire district is eligible for listing on the National Register under Criterion A at the local level of significance due to its association with "the development and peak period of the commercial history of San Juan Bautista from 1849 to 1938."<sup>3</sup> The nomination form also notes that the district is collectively eligible for listing at the local level of significance under Criterion C "for representing a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction" that together "form a cohesive historic district."<sup>4</sup>

The NRHP district nomination does not identify which features of 322 Third Street contribute to its historic significance. However, the DPR 523 form prepared for the property by Galvin Preservation Associates in 2006 as part of a citywide inventory of architectural resources within San Juan Bautista identified the following character-defining features for the building:

- Property built up to the property line
- Located within downtown San Juan Bautista
- Rectangular plan
- Symmetrical façade
- Flat roof with coping at the façade
- Concrete construction
- Single wood and glass front door flanked by side lights
- Display windows on either side of the front entrance, with three sashes per opening
- Awning sheltering the entire width of the façade<sup>5</sup>

### **Proposed Work at 322 Third Street**

The proposed project involves painting the exterior of the building with a different color and replacing the existing canvas awning at the with new canvas awning. The replacement scalloped awning will have a striped print, similar to the existing print. The colors will vary to include, black, red, and white.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards Compliance Analysis**

The following section provides an analysis of the proposed project's compatibility with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties ("Standards"), as required for projects involving major alterations to identified historic resources in Chapter 11-06 of the City of San Juan Bautista Municipal Code.

---

<sup>2</sup> Galvin Preservation Associates, *San Juan Bautista Third Street Historic District National Register Nomination Form*, section 7, page 13.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, section 8, page 24.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, section 8, page 25.

<sup>5</sup> Wanda Guibert, Volunteer for Galvin Preservation Associates, *DPR 523 Forms for 322 Third Street* (2006), 2.

This report's analysis of the proposed project's compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards uses the 2009 NRHP district's period of significance, and the character-defining features listed on the building's 2006 DPR form, as a basis for evaluating the effects of the proposed project on the historic building.

For 322 Third Street, a project that is compliant with the Standards should follow these guidelines:

*1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*

The property will continue to be used for commercial purposes, and as such, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 1.

*2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

The only feature or material of the property that is proposed to be removed or altered as part of the proposed project that is a character-defining feature as defined by the 2006 DPR 523 forms for the property is the colored print of the existing awning. The shape and length of awning will not be modified as part of the proposed work, and the change in color of the striped print will not affect the historic character of the property. As such, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 2.

*3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*

No conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings will be added to 322 Third Street as part of the proposed work. As such, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 3.

*4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*

The proposed modifications to the building will not affect elements of the building that have acquired historic significance in their own right. As such, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 4.

*5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

According to the 2006 DPR form prepared for the property, the established character-defining features of 322 Third Street that should be retained (or repaired or replaced in-kind if necessary) include the following:

- Property built up to the property line
- Located within downtown San Juan Bautista
- Rectangular plan
- Symmetrical façade
- Flat roof with coping at the façade
- Concrete construction
- Single wood and glass front door flanked by side lights
- Display windows on either side of the front entrance, with three sashes per opening
- Awning sheltering the entire width of the façade

Of the list above, only the non-historic awning material is to be replaced. As the new material is similar in material, color, print, and overall appearance, the modification is compliant with Standard number 6. The paint color at this building is not considered to be a character-defining element, nor is the existing finish original to the building. The modification of the paint color will not affect distinctive features that characterize the property, and the paint finish will remain the same in texture. As such, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 5.

*6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

The proposed project will replace the existing awning, and will match the existing awning in design, texture, and will vary slightly in color. The paint color is not considered to be a historic feature of the building, and the texture of the exterior will remain the same after the building is painted. As such, the proposed work is compliant with Standard 6.

*7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*

Chemical treatments will not be used for the proposed project, and the physical treatments to address rehabilitation of the historic building materials will be completed sensitively. The treatments in the proposed project's scope of work will not cause damage to the historic materials, and as such the proposed Project is compliant with Standard 7.

*8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.*

The propose work will not address issues regarding ground disturbances. At the current time, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 8.

*9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed work will not destroy the historic materials that characterize the property, as the modifications of the awning material and the paint color have been modified over time and are not original fabric, and are considered decorative in nature. For these reasons, the proposed Project is compliant with Standard 9.

*10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

No new additions or adjacent related new construction is proposed for this project. As such, the proposed project is compliant with Standard 10.

#### **Project Compliance Summary**

Compliance with the aforementioned standards is reflective of a sensitive approach to rehabilitation work, with the overarching goal of preserving the historic resource. Based on the analysis above, the proposed project to modify the historic commercial building at 322 Third Street appears to be compliant with all ten of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.