

CITY OF SAN JUAN BAUTISTA

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

STAFF REPORT

DATE: April 4th, 2017

SUBJECT: Site and Design Review – 107 Third Street

Applicant: Greg and Christin Burda

Zoning: Mixed Use

Assessor Parcel No.: 002-021-004

Size: 3917.279 ft²

Existing Land Use: Mixed Use

Environmental Review: Under Section 15331 of the California Environmental Quality Act, "Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation", the project is Categorically Exempt. The rationale for using this exemption is described in the "Process" section below.

Details: The property is located in the Mixed Use zone in the Historic District with commercial uses (Anza House and Jardines) on both sides on Third Street and a residential property behind it. The applicant is requesting site and design review approval for a restaurant and bar on the first floor with a two bedroom/two bathroom residential unit on the second floor. The proposed use would be a continuance of the previous use, which was an owner-occupied business.

Proposed Work at 107 Third Street: (From historic resource evaluation and impact report)

The proposed project involves exterior, interior, and site alterations to 107 Third Street, with the main goals of having a restaurant on the first floor of the main building, an apartment on the second floor of the main building, and additional dining, kitchen, utilities, garage, and storage space within an expanded rear addition.

Exterior

The project will involve limited work at the street-facing facade of the front portion of the building. Damaged historic wood siding will be repaired, and portions too damaged for repair will be replaced in kind with new wood siding matching the dimensions and profile of the historic wood siding. The building will be repainted from pink to a neutral, period-appropriate color, as determined by the City of San Juan Bautista and community input. Damaged portions of the historic second-floor balcony spanning the width of the facade will be repaired, and any elements damaged beyond repair will be replaced in kind. The existing historic wood multi-lite double-hung windows will be retained and rehabilitated. The historic paneled wood-and-glass doors at the first floor of the front facade will be rehabilitated with full perimeter weatherstripping added to each door. The two sets of doors flanking the main entry were previously sealed shut with the lower half furred over at exterior. The existing wood panels now covering the bottom half of the exterior face of these doors will be removed. Existing composition shingle roofing will be replaced to accommodate structural work on roof assembly.

The existing second floor balcony that overhangs the Third Street sidewalk will be rehabilitated. Any damaged or deteriorated elements will be repaired to the extent possible or replaced in kind. The deck of the balcony, which is the shed roof awning, will be repaired as needed with any elements damaged or deteriorated beyond serviceability to be replaced in kind. The deck surface receive a new waterproof membrane. The balcony may not be used as an occupied space since it does not appear that the existing structure was intended to serve as a deck. If balcony is occupied then a taller guardrail will need to be added.

More extensive alterations are proposed for the rear of the building. The existing one- story L-shaped rear addition is attached at the north end of west elevation of the main building. This rear addition currently contains a garage and kitchen areas, will be substantially rehabilitated with new framing added to the existing north and south board walls. The east-west leg of the addition is of wood board-and-batten construction with roll roofing on a gabled roof with a mix of early and replacement doors and windows. The garage portion of the addition is of wood framed construction with no current interior wall finish.

The rear addition will be rehabilitated within the existing footprint of the existing rear addition with some expansion for the new accessible toilet rooms at first floor level. The new rear addition will contain restaurant spaces along the east-west leg with the current garage portion getting a second story addition. Board-and-batten siding from the existing rear addition in serviceable condition will be retained with any replacement boards to match original in size and spacing.

Existing window openings at the north wall will be filled in. New windows at the south elevation of the addition will be wood sash, and a new "Carriage Style" sectional overhead garage door will be installed facing Franklin Street. The west elevation of the main portion and the south elevation of the addition will open onto a courtyard patio. An L-shaped exterior staircase will provide access to the second-floor storage space over the garage. The one-story portion of the addition will have a flat roof to allow for mechanical equipment with a secondary shed-roof overhang at its south side, while the two-story portion will have a gabled roof. The flat roof will have granulated cap sheet roofing and the gabled roof will get composition shingle roofing.

An existing rear one-story addition with a roof deck above, which is attached to the west elevation of the main building at its south end, will be removed entirely and replaced with a slightly larger one-story addition with a deck above. This space was originally added by attaching framing directly to the side of the main building exterior siding. This expanded addition will have board-and-batten siding to match size and spacing of the existing rear addition. The parapet height of the east-west addition will align with the height of the guardrail of the residential roof deck. The guardrail will be finished with lap siding while the parapet will receive board-and-batten siding. A straight-run staircase will lead from the courtyard to the west side of the second-floor deck, providing access to the second-floor apartment in the main building.

Interior

Interior alterations will include the removal of select existing partitions within the main building, as well as construction of new interior walls within the new rear additions. At the main building, an existing interior staircase connecting the first and second floors will be removed. The existing hearth and fireplace surround at the first floor of the main building will be removed and the firebox covered with new finishes. The existing firebox at second floor will also be covered with new finishes. The proposed first floor of the main building will include dining space, a bar, a reception/cashier space, and a kitchen service room. The proposed apartment at the second floor of the main building will have a new partition layout, and MEP systems.

At the rear addition, the reconfigured spaces will contain the commercial kitchen, prep and utility space, a garage, storage space, and two ADA-accessible restrooms that would be accessed from the courtyard patio. The addition below the roof deck will contain a dining area, with views of the courtyard patio, and will also provide the accessible entrance to the main building.

Site

Site work will be within the courtyard portion of the property and is primarily related to providing accessibility to the interior of building and access to the toilet rooms. To address the existing slope of the site, a ramp will be constructed along the south lot line and run west-east into the courtyard patio toward the accessible entrance at the west side of the main building. The courtyard patio will have permeable paving.

Process: Chapter 11-06 of the San Juan Bautista Municipal Code lays out the process for handling applications for alterations to properties that are included in the City of San Juan Bautista Register of Historic Properties, including both contributing buildings with status codes 1 through 5 and noncontributing buildings.

Under SJBMC Section 11-06-120, "Site plan and design review permit procedure for historic resources", Planning staff must review permit applications and determine the following:

- 1) **If the structure is more than forty-five (45) years old;**
 - a. This structure was built in 1870, so it is more than 45 years old.
- 2) **If the property has been previously inventoried as part of a Citywide comprehensive survey and what the current status code for the property is (see SJBMC 11-06-090 for the various possible status codes);**
 - a. This property was previously inventoried as part of a Citywide comprehensive survey, and has a status code of 5D1.
- 3) **If the property is listed on the City Register of Historic Resources;**
 - a. This property is listed on the City Register of Historic Resources.
- 4) **If the property is located within the boundaries of a designated historic district regardless of individual significance;**
 - a. This property is located within the boundaries of a designated historic district.
- 5) **If the property will require additional evaluation as part of the application process; and**
 - a. Due to the proposed alterations to the exterior appearance of the structure, this property will require additional evaluation as part of the application process.
- 6) **If the proposed alteration is a minor or major alteration.**
 - a. Based on the alterations proposed by the applicant, the proposed alterations fall under the definition of "major alterations".

Based on those determinations, the proper review procedure can be found in Section 11-06-120(C)(5):

(5) Applications for major alterations or demolition to properties that are included in the City of San Juan Bautista Register of Historic Resources, including those properties that contribute to a designated historic district with status codes of 1 through 5 or to noncontributing buildings within designated historic districts, shall require the following:

(a) A historic resource evaluation and impact report shall be prepared by a qualified architectural historian that includes a discussion of the property's historic significance, the determination of project impacts and the application of how the project does or does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the City of San Juan Bautista Design Guidelines. The report will also include a discussion on how the proposed changes may cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource in accordance with CEQA Guidelines and a discussion as to how the proposed project may impact the significance of a surrounding historic district, as applicable. The report may also include proposed measures to minimize or mitigate significant impacts, if such impacts exist.

a. An historic resource evaluation and impact report for this project was prepared by Rebecca Salgado, Architectural Historian at Garavaglia Architecture, Inc.

(b) The historic resource evaluation and impacts report will be attached to the site plan and design review application for review by the Historic Resources Board. The HRB will review the recommended impacts and treatments and make recommendations to the Planning Commission and applicant on ways to conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the City of San Juan Bautista's Design Guidelines. The Planning Commission will have discretionary authority over the approval of the application. Appeals on the determination made to the Planning Commission shall be directed to the City Council for approval.

a. The historic resource evaluation and impacts report is attached to the Site and Design Review application for the restaurant, bar, and residential unit at 107 Third Street. It is attached to this staff

report as well. The report confirms that the proposed project is “generally compliant with all ten of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.”

- b. There is only one effect on the property’s identified character-defining features, which is the proposed removal of a historic window at the secondary west elevation. The report states that: *“This window is minimally visible from the street, but if possible, should be retained. If it is necessary to close out this opening, one option would be to close the opening from the interior while retaining the window in place. Then, if this alteration were to be reversed in the future, the historic window would still be in place.”*

(c) Proposed major alterations that comply with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties shall be considered a Class 31 categorical exemption under CEQA and no further review is required.

- a. The historic resource evaluation and impacts report determined that the project is generally compliant with all ten of the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, so the project will be considered a Class 31 categorical exemption under CEQA and no further review is required.

Major Alterations to Interior

In Chapter 11-06-020 of the San Juan Bautista Municipal Code, the definition for “Major Alterations” covers alterations to both “*the exterior appearance of an existing building or structure,*” as well as “*the interior of a resource that is accessible to or has historically been made available to the public, including but not limited to areas commonly used as public spaces such as lobbies, meeting rooms, gathering rooms, public hallways, great halls, bank lobbies, shopping malls, stores, or other similar spaces.*” Some have made the argument that this gives the Historic Resources Board control over what alterations can be made to the interior of any historic building that has ever been open to the public. However, when covering the recommended treatment of interior spaces, the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties refers only to interior spaces “***that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building***” (p.91).

The historic resource evaluation and impacts report that was created for this project examined all of the "character-defining features" for the structure and none of those features were on the interior of the structure. In addition, the report reveals that the structure has had many different uses over the years, during which time many non-character-defining aspects of the interior have undoubtedly changed without detracting from the "overall historic character of the building." Therefore, staff recommends that the Historic Resources Board refrain from placing any burdensome restrictions on what the property owner may or may not do with the interior of the structure.

Action Required:

1. Verify posting of notice of public hearing
2. Open the Public Hearing
3. Receive staff report and supporting documents
4. Receive written comments, e-mail communication, oral testimony and public input.
5. Close the public hearing
6. Review the project materials and the historic resource evaluation and impacts report to ensure that the project complies with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the City of San Juan Bautista's Design Guidelines and make any necessary recommendations to the Planning Commission
7. Based upon your independent review and judgment of the staff report, historic resource evaluation and impacts report, written comments, email communication, and oral testimony on the project, the Historic Resources Board should take the following actions.
 - A. Recommend that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution 2017-XX, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the City of San Juan Bautista making a determination for a categorical exemption for Site and Design Review (SDR 2017-31) for a Mixed-Use restaurant, bar, and residential unit at 107 Third Street" under Section 15331 of the California Environmental Quality Act.
 - B. Recommend that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution 2017-XX, "A Resolution of the Planning Commission of the City of San Juan Bautista approving Site and Design Review Permit for a restaurant, bar, and residential unit at 107 Third Street (SDR 2017-31) Greg and Christin Burda (APN 002-021-004)."

Attachments:

1. Secretary of the Interior's Standards Review for 107 Third Street – Burda
2. SDR Packet for 107 Third Street – Burda
3. Environmental Information for 107 Third Street – Burda
4. Environmental Setting for 107 Third Street – Burda

5. SDR Application for 107 Third Street – Burda
6. Planning Commission Resolution 2017-XX for Categorical Exemption of SDR 2017-31 for 107 Third Street – Burda
7. Planning Commission Resolution 2017-XX for Approval of SDR 2017-31 for 107 Third Street – Burda